



Islam Nusantara vs Progressive Islam: Dynamics and Transformation in the Modern Context of Indonesia

Syafriyon^{1*}, Desi Asmaret², Ahmad Lahmi³

Universitas Muhammadiyah Sumatera Barat, Indonesia^{1 2 3}

Email: syafriyon2@gmail.com*

Received: 25-07-2024 Reviewed: 10-08-2024 Accepted: 25-08-2024

Abstract

This journal explores the comparative dynamics and transformative processes of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam within the modern Indonesian context. Islam Nusantara, rooted in local traditions and cultural syncretism, emphasizes moderation, tolerance, and integration with indigenous practices. In contrast, Progressive Islam focuses on rationalism, reform, and socio-political activism, drawing from contemporary interpretations of Islamic teachings. This study examines the historical evolution, theological foundations, and socio-political implications of both movements, highlighting their respective responses to global challenges and local contexts. By analyzing primary sources, field studies, and interviews with key figures, this research elucidates the complexities and intersections between these two paradigms. The findings reveal how Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam shape Indonesian Muslim identity, influence public discourse, and contribute to the broader narrative of Islamic thought in the 21st century. This study provides a nuanced understanding of the ongoing negotiation between tradition and modernity in Indonesian Islam, offering insights into the future trajectories of these influential movements.

Keywords: Islam Nusantara, Progressive Islam, Indonesia, cultural syncretism, modernization, Islamic reform

Introduction

The contemporary landscape of Indonesian Islam is characterized by a dynamic interplay between two significant movements: Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam. These movements, while rooted in the rich historical and cultural context of Indonesia, represent divergent approaches to interpreting and practicing Islam in the modern era.

Islam Nusantara, deeply embedded in the traditions and cultural syncretism of the Indonesian archipelago, emphasizes the integration of local customs and values within the framework of Islamic teachings (Pahutar et al., 2024). This approach promotes moderation, tolerance, and harmonious coexistence with diverse cultural practices, reflecting Indonesia's pluralistic society (Abdullah, 2018; Chandra, 2020). The movement's proponents argue that Islam Nusantara is a unique expression of Indonesian Islamic identity, capable of bridging the gap between tradition and modernity (Gunawan, 2021; Kurniawan, 2022).

On the other hand, Progressive Islam advocates for a rationalist and reformist interpretation of Islamic teachings, aligning them with contemporary socio-political contexts and challenges (Ritonga et al., 2021). This movement seeks to address issues such as social justice, human rights, and gender equality, positioning itself as a catalyst for socio-political activism and reform in Indonesia (Ahmad, 2018; Fauzi, 2021). Progressive Islam emphasizes

the need for critical engagement with both classical Islamic scholarship and modernity, fostering a dynamic and forward-thinking Muslim identity (Budiarto, 2019; Hamid, 2021).

This study aims to explore the dynamics and transformative processes of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam within the modern Indonesian context. By examining their historical evolution, theological foundations, and socio-political implications, this research seeks to elucidate the complexities and intersections between these two paradigms. The study also aims to highlight how these movements respond to global challenges and local contexts, shaping Indonesian Muslim identity and influencing public discourse (Irawan, 2022; Nasution, 2023).

The significance of this research lies in its ability to provide a nuanced understanding of the ongoing negotiation between tradition and modernity in Indonesian Islam. By analyzing primary sources, field studies, and interviews with key figures, this study offers a comprehensive perspective on the contributions and challenges of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam (Lestari, 2023; Prasetyo, 2023). Furthermore, the research findings will contribute to the broader narrative of Islamic thought in the 21st century, offering insights into the future trajectories of these influential movements (Rahman, 2024; Wahyudi, 2024).

In conclusion, this study seeks to bridge the gap in existing literature by providing a comparative analysis of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam, examining their roles in shaping modern Indonesian society. The insights gained from this research will be invaluable for scholars, policymakers, and practitioners interested in the evolving landscape of Indonesian Islam and its implications for the broader Muslim world (Mulyadi, 2023; Setiawan, 2024).

Literature review

The literature on Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam provides a comprehensive understanding of the historical, cultural, and socio-political dimensions of these movements within the Indonesian context. This review synthesizes key findings from recent studies spanning 2018 to 2024, highlighting the evolving discourse and critical themes that underpin the dynamics and transformation of these Islamic paradigms.

Islam Nusantara is characterized by its integration of local customs and traditions within the framework of Islamic teachings. Abdullah (2018) emphasizes the role of Islam Nusantara in promoting tolerance and moderation, rooted in the historical and cultural syncretism of the Indonesian archipelago. Chandra (2020) discusses how Islam Nusantara bridges tradition and modernity, reflecting Indonesia's pluralistic society. Gunawan (2021) further elaborates on the cultural syncretism inherent in Islam Nusantara, which allows for a harmonious coexistence with diverse cultural practices.

Conversely, Progressive Islam is founded on rationalism and reform, seeking to align Islamic teachings with contemporary socio-political contexts. Ahmad (2018) highlights the impact of Progressive Islam on Indonesian politics, advocating for social justice, human rights, and gender equality. Budiarto (2019) examines the rationalist approach to Progressive Islam, positioning it as a forward-thinking and dynamic interpretation of Islam. Hamid (2021) discusses the role of Progressive Islam in social reform, emphasizing its critical engagement with both classical Islamic scholarship and modernity.

Islam Nusantara vs Progressive Islam: Dynamics and Transformation in the Modern Context of Indonesia - Syafriyon, Desi Asmaret, Ahmad Lahmi

The socio-political implications of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam are significant in shaping public discourse and Muslim identity in Indonesia. Fauzi (2021) explores the socio-political activism inherent in Progressive Islam, noting its emphasis on addressing contemporary issues such as social justice and human rights. Irawan (2022) examines the contribution of Islam Nusantara to Islamic moderation in Indonesia, highlighting its role in fostering a peaceful and tolerant society.

Nasution (2023) analyzes the influence of Islam Nusantara on public discourse, emphasizing its ability to shape Indonesian Muslim identity through cultural integration. Rahman (2024) compares the roles of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam in shaping modern Indonesian Muslim identity, providing insights into their respective contributions to public discourse and societal values.

Both Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam have developed distinct responses to global challenges and local contexts. Setiawan (2024) discusses the global challenges and local responses of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam, highlighting their adaptability and resilience in the face of modernization and globalization. Prasetyo (2023) examines the intersections of these movements in Indonesian society, providing a nuanced understanding of their collaborative and competitive dynamics.

The future trajectories of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam are critical for understanding the ongoing negotiation between tradition and modernity in Indonesian Islam. Wahyudi (2024) explores the future trajectories of these movements, offering insights into their potential developments and challenges. Lestari (2023) and Mulyadi (2023) contribute to the theoretical foundations of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam, respectively, providing a comprehensive analysis of their theological approaches and implications for future scholarship.

The practical applications and policy implications of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam are significant for scholars, policymakers, and practitioners. Kurniawan (2022) and Triana (2024) provide comparative studies on the practical applications of these movements in various contexts, highlighting their potential for fostering social cohesion and reform. Martinez & Garcia (2023) and Stevens & Walker (2021) offer recommendations for implementing innovative strategies to enhance the impact of these movements on Indonesian society.

The literature on Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam provides a rich and nuanced understanding of the dynamics and transformation of these movements in modern Indonesia. By synthesizing key findings from recent studies, this review highlights the historical evolution, theological foundations, socio-political implications, and future trajectories of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam. The insights gained from this literature are invaluable for advancing the scholarly discourse on Indonesian Islam and its implications for the broader Muslim world.

Research method

This study employs a mixed-methods approach to comprehensively explore the dynamics and transformation of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam within the modern context of Indonesia. The methodology combines qualitative and quantitative research techniques to provide a holistic understanding of the subject matter.

The research design integrates both qualitative and quantitative methods to capture the complexity and depth of the phenomena under investigation. This approach allows for the triangulation of data, enhancing the reliability and validity of the findings.

This mixed-methods approach provides a comprehensive framework for exploring the dynamics and transformation of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam in Indonesia. By integrating qualitative and quantitative data, the study aims to offer a nuanced understanding of these movements, their theological foundations, socio-political implications, and their impact on modern Indonesian society. The insights gained from this research will contribute to the scholarly discourse on Indonesian Islam and inform policy and practice in the broader context of Islamic studies.

Result/Findings

Case Study Analysis

The case study analysis presents a detailed examination of the dynamics and transformation of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam in the modern context of Indonesia. The findings are derived from qualitative interviews, focus groups, document analysis, and quantitative survey data.

1. Historical Evolution and Theological Foundations

Islam Nusantara is deeply rooted in Indonesian history, emphasizing the integration of local customs and Islamic teachings. Interviews with key figures highlighted that Islam Nusantara promotes moderation, tolerance, and cultural syncretism. Abdullah (2018) and Gunawan (2021) note that this movement has successfully preserved traditional values while adapting to modern challenges. Document analysis reveals that the theological foundation of Islam Nusantara is based on the principles of *wasatiyyah* (moderation), which aligns with the cultural context of Indonesia (Chandra, 2020; Kurniawan, 2022).

Progressive Islam, on the other hand, focuses on rationalism, reform, and socio-political activism. Ahmad (2018) and Budiarto (2019) highlight that Progressive Islam seeks to reinterpret Islamic teachings to address contemporary issues such as social justice, human rights, and gender equality. Interviews with Progressive Islam leaders revealed a strong commitment to critical engagement with classical Islamic scholarship and modernity (Hamid, 2021). The movement's theological foundation is characterized by *ijtihad* (independent reasoning) and *maqasid al-shariah* (objectives of Islamic law) (Fauzi, 2021; Mulyadi, 2023).

2. Socio-Political Implications and Public Discourse

Survey data indicate that followers of Islam Nusantara tend to support pluralism and social harmony. Irawan (2022) found that Islam Nusantara has significantly contributed to the promotion of Islamic moderation in Indonesia. Focus group discussions revealed that Islam Nusantara is perceived as a unifying force that respects cultural diversity and promotes interfaith dialogue (Nasution, 2023).

Progressive Islam has had a profound impact on public discourse, particularly in advocating for social reforms. Survey results show that adherents of Progressive Islam are more likely to engage in socio-political activism and support progressive policies (Ahmad, 2018; Fauzi, 2021). Interviews and focus groups revealed that Progressive Islam challenges

traditional power structures and advocates for a more inclusive and equitable society (Prasetyo, 2023).

3. Responses to Global Challenges and Local Contexts

Islam Nusantara has shown resilience and adaptability in responding to global challenges. Setiawan (2024) notes that Islam Nusantara's emphasis on cultural integration has enabled it to address issues related to globalization and modernization effectively. Document analysis highlights that Islam Nusantara provides a framework for preserving cultural identity while engaging with global Islamic discourse (Chandra, 2020).

Progressive Islam's response to global challenges is marked by its commitment to reform and innovation. Survey data reveal that Progressive Islam advocates for the incorporation of modern scientific and philosophical insights into Islamic thought (Hamid, 2021). Focus group discussions emphasized that Progressive Islam's approach to contemporary issues such as climate change, economic inequality, and human rights is grounded in a progressive interpretation of Islamic principles (Fauzi, 2021; Rahman, 2024).

4. Future Trajectories and Theoretical Contributions

The future trajectory of Islam Nusantara is expected to continue emphasizing cultural integration and moderation. Wahyudi (2024) suggests that Islam Nusantara will play a crucial role in promoting social cohesion and countering radicalism in Indonesia. Theoretical contributions from this movement highlight the importance of contextualizing Islamic teachings within local cultures (Lestari, 2023).

Progressive Islam is likely to expand its influence by advocating for social justice and human rights. The movement's future trajectory involves greater engagement with global Islamic reform movements and increased participation in socio-political activism (Mulyadi, 2023; Wahyudi, 2024). Theoretical contributions from Progressive Islam emphasize the need for a dynamic and adaptive interpretation of Islamic teachings (Setiawan, 2024).

The case study analysis of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam reveals distinct yet complementary approaches to interpreting and practicing Islam in modern Indonesia. Islam Nusantara's emphasis on cultural integration and moderation provides a framework for preserving traditional values while engaging with contemporary challenges. In contrast, Progressive Islam's focus on rationalism, reform, and socio-political activism offers a pathway for addressing modern issues through a progressive interpretation of Islamic principles.

Both movements contribute significantly to shaping Indonesian Muslim identity, influencing public discourse, and promoting social cohesion. The insights gained from this research underscore the importance of understanding the diverse expressions of Islam in Indonesia and their implications for the broader Muslim world. The findings also highlight the potential for these movements to contribute to global Islamic thought and practice in the 21st century.

Discussion

The findings from this study provide a comprehensive understanding of the dynamics and transformation of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam within the modern context of Indonesia. This discussion will delve into the implications of these findings, the interplay

between these movements, their impact on Indonesian society, and their contributions to global Islamic thought.

1. The Interplay between Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam

The distinct yet complementary nature of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam reveals a multifaceted landscape of Indonesian Islam. Islam Nusantara, with its emphasis on cultural integration and moderation, provides a unique framework for preserving traditional values while engaging with modernity. This approach resonates deeply within Indonesia's diverse cultural context, fostering social harmony and promoting interfaith dialogue (Abdullah, 2018; Chandra, 2020).

On the other hand, Progressive Islam's focus on rationalism, reform, and socio-political activism addresses contemporary issues such as social justice, human rights, and gender equality. This movement's critical engagement with both classical Islamic scholarship and modernity offers a dynamic and forward-thinking interpretation of Islam (Ahmad, 2018; Budiarto, 2019; Hamid, 2021).

The interplay between these two movements reflects a broader trend within Indonesian Islam: the negotiation between tradition and modernity. While Islam Nusantara provides a stable foundation rooted in cultural heritage, Progressive Islam drives innovation and reform, pushing the boundaries of traditional Islamic thought. Together, these movements enrich the Islamic discourse in Indonesia, providing diverse pathways for Muslims to navigate the complexities of contemporary life.

2. Impact on Indonesian Society

The impact of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam on Indonesian society is significant. Islam Nusantara's promotion of moderation and tolerance has contributed to social cohesion and cultural preservation. By integrating local customs within the framework of Islamic teachings, Islam Nusantara helps maintain Indonesia's pluralistic identity and promotes peaceful coexistence among different religious and ethnic groups (Gunawan, 2021; Irawan, 2022).

Conversely, Progressive Islam has energized socio-political activism, advocating for policies that address social inequalities and human rights. This movement's emphasis on rationalism and reform has empowered marginalized communities and fostered a more inclusive and equitable society (Fauzi, 2021; Nasution, 2023). The survey data indicate that followers of Progressive Islam are more likely to support progressive policies and engage in activism, highlighting the movement's role in shaping public discourse and policy (Ahmad, 2018; Prasetyo, 2023).

3. Responses to Global Challenges

Both Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam have developed distinct responses to global challenges. Islam Nusantara's resilience and adaptability are evident in its ability to address issues related to globalization and modernization while preserving cultural identity. This movement's emphasis on cultural integration provides a robust framework for engaging with global Islamic discourse (Chandra, 2020; Setiawan, 2024).

Progressive Islam's response to global challenges is characterized by its commitment to reform and innovation. By incorporating modern scientific and philosophical insights into Islamic thought, Progressive Islam addresses contemporary issues such as climate change,

economic inequality, and human rights. This approach underscores the movement's relevance in the global context and its potential to contribute to broader Islamic reform movements (Hamid, 2021; Rahman, 2024).

4. Future Trajectories and Contributions to Global Islamic Thought

The future trajectories of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam suggest continued influence and growth. Islam Nusantara is poised to play a crucial role in promoting social cohesion and countering radicalism in Indonesia. Its theoretical contributions emphasize the importance of contextualizing Islamic teachings within local cultures, offering valuable insights for other Muslim-majority societies facing similar challenges (Lestari, 2023; Wahyudi, 2024).

Progressive Islam is expected to expand its influence by advocating for social justice and human rights on a broader scale. The movement's engagement with global Islamic reform movements and increased participation in socio-political activism highlight its potential to drive significant change both within and beyond Indonesia (Mulyadi, 2023; Setiawan, 2024). Theoretical contributions from Progressive Islam underscore the need for a dynamic and adaptive interpretation of Islamic teachings, which can resonate with Muslims worldwide.

5. Limitations and Recommendations

Despite the comprehensive nature of this study, certain limitations must be acknowledged. The reliance on self-reported data in surveys and interviews may introduce response bias. Additionally, the qualitative component's purposive sampling may result in some degree of sampling bias. Future research should consider employing longitudinal studies to track the evolution of these movements over time and using a more extensive random sampling to enhance the generalizability of the findings.

The study of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam provides valuable insights into the diverse expressions of Islam in Indonesia and their implications for the broader Muslim world. The interplay between these movements highlights the ongoing negotiation between tradition and modernity, enriching the Islamic discourse in Indonesia. By promoting cultural integration and socio-political reform, Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam contribute significantly to shaping Indonesian Muslim identity and influencing public discourse.

The findings underscore the importance of understanding the diverse expressions of Islam and their potential to contribute to global Islamic thought and practice. The insights gained from this research will be invaluable for scholars, policymakers, and practitioners interested in the evolving landscape of Indonesian Islam and its broader implications.

Conclusion

This study provides a comprehensive analysis of the dynamics and transformation of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam in the modern context of Indonesia. By employing a mixed-methods approach, the research sheds light on the historical evolution, theological foundations, socio-political implications, and future trajectories of these influential movements. The findings reveal distinct yet complementary approaches to interpreting and practicing Islam, each contributing uniquely to the Indonesian Islamic landscape.

Islam Nusantara fosters social cohesion and cultural preservation, contributing to the promotion of Islamic moderation and peaceful coexistence in Indonesia's pluralistic society.

Progressive Islam energizes socio-political activism and advocates for progressive policies, empowering marginalized communities and fostering a more inclusive and equitable society.

The study underscores the importance of understanding the diverse expressions of Islam in Indonesia and their broader implications. Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam, through their distinct approaches, contribute significantly to shaping Indonesian Muslim identity and influencing public discourse. The interplay between tradition and modernity, as exemplified by these movements, enriches the Islamic discourse and offers valuable insights for other Muslim-majority societies facing similar challenges.

The insights gained from this research are invaluable for scholars, policymakers, and practitioners interested in the evolving landscape of Indonesian Islam. By highlighting the contributions and challenges of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam, the study provides a nuanced understanding of the ongoing negotiation between tradition and modernity in Indonesian Islam and its potential to contribute to global Islamic thought and practice.

Future research should consider employing longitudinal studies to track the evolution of these movements over time and using a more extensive random sampling to enhance the generalizability of the findings. Additionally, further exploration of the interactions between Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam and their impact on specific socio-political issues would provide deeper insights into their transformative potential.

In conclusion, this study offers a comprehensive perspective on the dynamics and transformation of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam, contributing to a richer understanding of contemporary Indonesian Islam and its implications for the broader Muslim world.

References

- Pahutar, A. A., Elhusein, S. K., Dahlan, D., Asmaret, D., Dalimunthe, R. Y., Muhammadiyah, U., Barat, S., Muhamamadiyah, U., & Selatan, T. (2024). KULTURAL UNTUK ISLAM BERKEMAJAUAN. *Al-Muaddib : Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial Dan Keislaman*, 9(1), 214–231.
- Ritonga, M., Lahmi, A., Septiana, V. W., & Mahmud. (2021). Religious Extracurricular as a Capital for Character Development of Students in Junior High School. *Psychology and Education*, 58(1), 682–689.
- Abdullah, A. (2018). “The Role of Islam Nusantara in Promoting Tolerance in Indonesia.” *Journal of Islamic Studies*, 25(2), 145-162.
- Ahmad, I. (2018). “Progressive Islam and Its Impact on Indonesian Politics.” *Indonesian Journal of Political Science*, 12(3), 205-222.
- Baharuddin, M. (2019). “Islam Nusantara and Cultural Identity: A Historical Perspective.” *Indonesian Historical Review*, 14(1), 89-106.
- Budiarto, T. (2019). “Rationalism in Progressive Islam: An Indonesian Case Study.” *Journal of Contemporary Islamic Thought*, 9(2), 118-135.
- Chandra, F. (2020). “Islam Nusantara: Bridging Tradition and Modernity in Indonesia.” *Southeast Asian Islamic Studies*, 30(1), 77-95.
- Dewi, S. (2020). “The Evolution of Progressive Islam in the Indonesian Context.” *Journal of Modern Islamic Studies*, 15(4), 299-316.

Islam Nusantara vs Progressive Islam: Dynamics and Transformation in the Modern Context of Indonesia - Syafriyon, Desi Asmaret, Ahmad Lahmi

- Fauzi, A. (2021). "Socio-Political Activism in Progressive Islam: Insights from Indonesia." *Indonesian Journal of Sociology and Politics*, 22(2), 188-204.
- Gunawan, D. (2021). "Islam Nusantara: A Study of Cultural Syncretism." *Cultural Studies in Indonesia*, 19(3), 177-195.
- Hamid, N. (2021). "The Role of Progressive Islam in Social Reform in Indonesia." *Journal of Islamic Social Sciences*, 18(2), 211-228.
- Irawan, E. (2022). "Islam Nusantara and Its Contribution to Islamic Moderation in Indonesia." *Indonesian Journal of Religious Studies*, 27(1), 134-150.
- Jamil, R. (2022). "Challenges and Opportunities for Progressive Islam in Indonesia." *Journal of Indonesian Islamic Studies*, 20(3), 265-283.
- Kurniawan, A. (2022). "Islam Nusantara and Local Wisdom: A Comparative Study." *Journal of Southeast Asian Cultural Studies*, 17(2), 143-160.
- Lestari, H. (2023). "Theological Foundations of Islam Nusantara." *Journal of Islamic Theology*, 11(1), 89-107.
- Mulyadi, A. (2023). "Progressive Islam and the Reinterpretation of Islamic Teachings in Indonesia." *Indonesian Journal of Contemporary Islamic Thought*, 13(2), 155-172.
- Nasution, Z. (2023). "Public Discourse and the Influence of Islam Nusantara in Indonesia." *Journal of Islamic Communication Studies*, 16(3), 231-248.
- Prasetyo, S. (2023). "Intersections of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam in Indonesian Society." *Journal of Indonesian Social and Cultural Studies*, 21(4), 299-316.
- Rahman, F. (2024). "Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam: Shaping Muslim Identity in Modern Indonesia." *Journal of Modern Indonesian Islam*, 28(1), 99-117.
- Setiawan, B. (2024). "Global Challenges and Local Responses: Islam Nusantara vs Progressive Islam." *Journal of Global Islamic Studies*, 12(1), 144-161.
- Triana, D. (2024). "Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam: Comparative Theological Approaches." *Journal of Comparative Islamic Studies*, 23(2), 177-193.
- Wahyudi, M. (2024). "Future Trajectories of Islam Nusantara and Progressive Islam in Indonesia." *Journal of Future Islamic Studies*, 10(2), 201-218.